G.R.S. IX—5]

Previous references. 1922. File No. 32-22

(Rej) Serial Nos. 146

Later references.

Reserve

GENERAL AND REVENUE SECRETARIAT.

Serial Nos. Two

Part B for June 23

SUBJECT

Submits for the consideration of Govt certain suggestions on the purposes of the Committee

No 1112
16.6.23

To,
Mr H. Krishna Rao
Member, Bryone Legis. Council
Hosdroppa Post

28/6 Acknowledges the receipt of your communication regarding the above.

Printed on the Multigraph.

13.7.23

G. R. S. 11] 1922

GENERAL AND REVENUE SECRETARIAT.

(Reforms)

NOTES.

Ref File No. 32-22

FILE HEADING.

Individual Representations on the Proposals of the Reforms Committee

From

Rao A. Srinivasa Rao. Bobbili

No. - Dated 15.6.23 Received 16.6.23.

Diary No. 776	Enclos. / Spare Copies.	Serial No. /

BRIEF ABSTRACT OF LETTER.

Submits for the consideration of Govt certain suggestions on the proposals of the Committee

NOTES AND ORDERS.

Chief Secy's Confdl D.O. dated 16.6.23.

Please acknowledge & send this back to me.

Submitted with draft

Done 16.6.23.

Done

NOTES—First Sheet.

Ref File No. 32 of 1922

Serial No.	
6.	To Mr. A. Krishna Rao. Member. Mysore Legis Council. Hosakote Letter no 1112. Dt. 16. 6. 1923. Stating that the Suggestions refd to in Sl 1 will receive the attention of Govt. Recommitted as directed 18/6
	No sufficient documents here. Memo opened Dewan) 19/6 19/6 19/6

DIARY No 776

HOSAKOPPA KRISHNA RAO

1922 —1923

Rep.

32-22

Hosakoppa Post,
(Koppa-Kadur)
Date 13th June 1923

To

R. mathen Esq, B.a,

Chief Secretary to Government.

Bangalore

Sir.

I have the honor to send herewith my criticism of the report of the Sel Committee on the Constitutional Development in mysore for the Kind Consideration of the Government of His Highness the Maharaja.

Please acknowledge me
I send herewith for an acknowledgment.

I have the honor to be
Sir.
Your most obedient Servant.

H Krishnarao

Mysore Reforms.

Memo of objections and criticisms on the Report of the Seal Committee.

By

Sriyut Hosakoppa Krishna Rao.

With the report of the Committee appointed to work out the details to give effect to the Government announcement of constitutional reforms, has vanished the last lingering ray of hope if any remained at all of the people of Mysore regarding beneficial changes in the political structure of the State. Excepting a few reactionaries, toadies and self-seekers who for want of any appreciably large or influential following are found scattered in the conservative fold, the announcement has failed to satisfy any section of the people, large or small. The report of the Committee has done all that it could to whittle down the reforms if at all they can be called so. There is still the Executive Government which having every-where the whip hand will, in carrying ---- out the reforms in practice, stick to the letter of the rules, brush aside provisos, nullify or unduly water the discretionary provisions, take advantage of every provision in their favour and thereby further dilute any little essence that might accidentally have escaped the attention of the Committee. The intention and purpose of appointment of Committees were too well known from precedents here and elsewhere to inspire confidence in the ----- public mind. The terms of reference so rigid and circumscribed in scope and character set at rest all doubts as regards the functions and usefulness of the Committee. To top all the majority of the personnel of the Committee were persons ---- whose unfriendly attitude towards political reforms and popular demands was no secret. And yet a small thinking section of the

(5

people believed that with all the short-comings in the announcement and the inelastic nature of the terms of reference, the Chairman, an erudite scholar and Indian authority on constitutional history and Messrs. Srinivasa Rao and Venkteshaya the two stalwart patriots and unbending champions of freedom and progress would at least evolve a polity though rudimentary which would form the solid unalterable plan and ground work of an enduring political fabric to be raised at no distant future. The beaming intelligence, the depth of learning, the deep --- philosophical insight into the working of the various polities of the world, both modern and ancient, the mature wisdom and collective experience of the Chairman should have naturally yielded better results than those arrived at by the Committee. It is regrettable that the report merely sets forth in grandiloquent terms the most modern political theories, maxims and postulates, a comparative description of the political institutions, the various devices, safeguards, checks and counter-checks in vogue in the different states of the world, learned disquisitions on the socio-political and socio-economic institutions of ancient India, all fit for discourses in the Lyceum or a University lecture room and of no earthly use for the people of Mysore whom the report primarily and intimately ---- concerns. On reading through that portion of the report --- relating to the elaboration of modern political theories one is reminded of a book entitled " Snakes in Iceland " wherein is to be found descriptions of various kinds of snakes separately written and ending with the words "this snake is not in Iceland". Similarly every conceivable theory and all imaginable polities have been thrashed out only to be rejected as not applicable to

the State of Mysore. While the Chairman's intimate knowledge and grasp of the subjects he deals with amaze the reader his efforts to twist them to prove them inapplicable or to exalt our tinsels to the diginity of, if not above, first rate political institutions in states modern and --- ancient by misinterpretations and misdirections cannot fail to reflect either on his vast learning or sincerity. It is either pseudo-scientific and political snobbery or a deliberate attempt to daze/stun and bamboozle the people into believing that they have been given something which no ---- people in the world, not even Japan, Switzerland and the United States of America have yet got. Either way the report stands equally discredited. Our revered Vice-Chancellor gives very poor credit to the intelligence of Mysore people if he ever believed that his treatise could dazzle, daze or blur their clear vision and blind them to the issues involved. A high flown and pompous political thesis comparing and contrasting our future polity under the reforms with those of the politically advanced west with a verdict implied or expressed in favour of the former, may titilate the vanity or flatter the vaingloriousness of a few who are not farsighted enough to envisage the ideal or goal towards which we have to strive if we are not to lag behind in the world race for rapid progress and --- advance. But for those who have the country's interests at heart, and they are many, no amount of glare or glamour can mar their clearsightedness and to them both the path and the goal are clearly though distantly visible. ------ Appeals to sentiment and emotions have also been availed

8

17

of where dazzling and dazing are found insufficient to --- support the strange theories and still stranger applications thereof. Since it rests with the Government to give or take whatever it pleases, it would have saved much trouble, worry and anxiety if merely the report had stated " so much and no more ". All the knowledge and learning of the --- scholar could have been conserved and utilised for the ---- benefit of a political science class or for a treatise on the comparative merits of the worlds' different polities. So much about the revered Chairman whom we know only as a renowned scholar and a venerable savant and at no time as a sound politician. or a Constitutionalist of repute

From the report proper we turn with a longing and anticipation for vigorous criticism and relentless exposure of the hollowness of the proposals and recommendations to the dissenting minute of the accredited spokesmen of the people, Messrs. Srinivasa Rao and Venkteshaya. Here again only keen disappointment stares us in the face. Excepting that portion of the minute relating to the franchise, the rest contains only namby-pamby expressions of pious hopes that the Representative Assembly would at some remote ----- indefinite future be the sole arbiter of the political ---- destiny of the State and that all such power as that ----- plastic mischievous and pro-Government ~~the Legislative~~ ~~Council~~ the Legislative Council intermediate body, is invested with are hoped to be held in trust to gradually devolve on the popular house. But unfortunately these hopes and wishes are not warranted by any single recommendation or clearly expressed passage in the report. We have to find fault with yet another ---

member of the Committee -- ~~I mean~~ our esteemed countryman and foremost citizen Dewan Bahadur K. P. Puttanna Chetty. Before his appointment on the Committee he had unmistakably expressed the opinion that the reforms were inadequate. His concurrence with the majority report without even a dissenting note is astonishing. His long and successful official career, ~~the~~ his equally long and successful service in public life and his accumulated wealth of experience and mature wisdom, all these were believed to be utilised in the interests of the people to serve whom he had disdained to enjoy the rest he had so richly earned. It is difficult nay impossible to account try however much one may either for the reticence of the Dewan Bahadur or for the very poor performance of our redoubtable champions of the popular cause. One can therefore only exclaim " unfortunate Mysore " !

Amidst all the confusing and confounding theorising contrasts and comparisons there is one and the only redeeming ~~reedming~~ feature the elixir vitae of the report -- the learned and impartial discussion of the question of communal representation. Ever since this lamentable question cropped up there has not been such a just and fair treatment and impartial solution as are to be found in the report. It deserves to be treasured up to serve as a model to such other States as may be confronted with similar problems. The Committee ----- deserves therefore the thanks of not only all minorities and ---- backward communities, but of the whole State for an equitable solution of a knotty and vexed problem.

The most objectionable feature of the report is the ---

10

(9

attempt frequently made therein to draw into the vertex of politics the person of the Ruler. Wherever scope is provided to the executive to override public opinion and act contrary to the wishes of the people, the throne is held forth as a shield to protect the offending Executive from attacks and resentment of the demos. Although the Committee and those that may hope to benefit from the provision may not scent danger from such an injudicious step, the undesirable results of such a short sighted policy are too patent to all those argues ~~that the person of the Ruler~~ to whom the person of the Ruler is sacrosanct. The Committee, should be above politics and yet deliberately drags him down to the field of controversial politics and makes him responsible for irresponsible actions of the executive Government. The arrangement is --- deliberately designed to stiffle criticism and bar all appeal to the throne against executive high-handedness. To camouflage this motive the report attempts to identify the Ruler with the people while as a matter of fact and in justice and fairness, the Sovereign ought to remain, in the absence of other safeguards such as resignation of the executive, appeal to an independent Judiciary, obligatory referendum, devices successfully employed in western countries as constitutional checks against executive vagaries, the final appellate ----- authority in all matters of disagreement between the Executive and the people. The arrangement recommended by the Committee places the Sovereign, if at all he can claim to represent the people (a too presumptuous a claim for any Ruler to make in these days) in the inconsistent position of a party acting as a Judge. It is also a political blunder of no small -- magnitude to expose the person of the Ruler to vicissitudes

of exigent politics where adverse and even carping criticism would be inevitable. The 17th. Century notions of Kingship have become legendary and if the Executive counts upon such sort of respect for the throne as used to be inspired by awe of power and authority born of ignorance it has only to be said that it is quite out of touch with the altered sentiments and ideas of the people in whose interests they claim to govern. The fact cannot be hidden that the materialistic and utilitarian civilisation of the west has so revolutionised ideas of relationship of the people to the Ruler that in most of the western countries the throne is considered a nuisance and hindrance to progress and every day we see efforts of the aggressive proleteriat to assert itself more and more and wise and far sighted if not sympathetic Rulers ungrudgingly and gracefully yielding more in their own ---- interests. The fate of Rulers who were ill-advised and hoped to perpetuate autocracy and the chaotic condition into which their obstinacy led their Kingdoms are matters of ---- history.

Power and wealth have ceased to awe or attract the --- demos who are slowly but surely coming into their own. The death-knell of autocracy, militarism and capitalism has sounded. If those who are still in possession of power and wealth do not climb down and condescend to lead the aspiring masses they will inevitably be swamped sooner or later.

Fortunately for India, thanks to the teachings however defective, of a religion which enjoins Bhakti reverential love, towards the King who rules in the name of God, the

(1)

western indifference, if not contempt, for the Crown has not yet been imbibed by the Indian peoples. The worst extremists mean no disrespect to the person or throne of His Majesty though living across the seas thousands of miles away. It is the bureaucracy they are out to fight. To shield itself from attacks, criticisms and responsibilities it does not scruple to entrench itself behind the throne or indentify itself with the latter to serve as pretext for trampling down agitation characterising honest criticism as rank ---- sedition. Every conceivable provision of existing penal regulations is availed of and new fetters are forged with lightning speed with the help of complaisant legislatures to suppress, oppress and persecute well meaning and patriotic persons with no ulterior motives or axes of their own to grind Success, though apparent and imagined, leads them on to further excesses oblivious of consequences. The ultimate result of such a blind policy is gradual loss of respect for the throne which the bureaucracy has taught the people to confound with itself. The Rulers if they are strong far sighted and sympathetic will guide the administration smoothly and satisfactorily acting as a brake on the excessive zeal of their Executive Governments. But a continuity of an unbroken line of efficient Rulers cannot be guaranteed under the system of hereditary succession. In the event of any weak and incompetent person ascending the throne any junto may so mismanage matters as to bring the throne into disrepute, if not actual grief. The fate of the Ruling house of Russia as also the subsequent condition of that vast Empire should be eye-openers

(12

to Rulers and subjects alike. Though such a radical and suicidal change of views is never likely to infect the pious Godfearing conservative Indian people, yet respect born of awe is gone giving place however to a higher and nobler concept. A constitutional Ruler is believed to be the prime and necessary factor of any well governed and progressive State. In his own interests, in the interests of the State and for the good of the people it is however desired that he ~~is to~~ should be bound by a constitution which while ----- guaranteeing permanancy and integrity of the throne would be elastic enough to meet the ever growing aspirations of the people to be associated with the Government of their country. No polity can endure permanently which depends on personalities for its continuance. It must be so laid down that it should be impossible for any capricious self-willed or effeminate Ruler or his zealous advisers to override the express wishes of the people who shall also be similarly bound to prevent encroachment on the prerogatives of the Crown. It is in such a polity that the Crown endears itself to the people as part and parcel of one entire whole. It is such a lasting arrangement which will give no room or cause for friction between the Ruler and the ruled and under which revolutions would be unknown, that every loyal and dutiful subject of a Ruler should endeavour to secure for the State. Any system of administration which concentrates all powers in an irresponsible Executive Government impatient of criticism and taking shelter behind the throne however neatly camouflaged and by whatever amount of sophistry supported cannot last long and is bound to crumble sooner or later.

Mysore Reforms.

14
10
(15

The immediate necessity for reforms lies in the ever increasing consciousness of the governed to their political rights and privileges which engenders the desire for closer association with the administration of the country. Institution of reforms necessarily therefore implies the devolutions of certain important functions hitherto discharged by the crown through the Executive Government to the representatives of the people and also an elastic provision for ----- further transference of powers as the popular bodies advance in knowledge and experience of administration. Judged by this universally accepted criterion the report not only falls far below the mark but is highly retrograde in effect. The fullest advantage has been taken of the provisos to the concessions contained in the announcement to tie the hands of the popular bodies and strengthen the position of the Executive Government and every artifice supplied by analogy, science and political chicanery has been availed of to ---- confound and camouflage real issues. Instead of providing checks against the arbitrariness, vagaries and pranks of the Executive by vesting the representative bodies with necessary powers the report by the largest stretch of exegesis confers on the Executive Government powers which in the absence of such clearly defined scope of its functions as the report lays down it would not have dared to exercise without previously ascertaining the attitude of the people or their representatives. The restraining influence of moral ----- obligation of the Government to the people is wholly removed and ~~to play to its heart's content~~ a legal sanction accorded to it to play to its heart's content the wastrel and the bully it has always proved to be. The control, if any which is sought to be imposed

over it is so indirect and nebulous as to be negligible and the sanction it requires for the maddest career it may chose to plunge into is so formal and easy to secure as to amount to the possession of a carte blanche. In short, the powers of the executive under the reforms are unlimited and are --- though it sounds paradoxical, independent of even the throne which creates and uncreates them. It seems therefore that the announcement of reforms has been made not as was anticipated and desired, to give more powers to the popular bodies but to perpetuate and strengthen the position of the Executive Government.

The Representative Assembly had, as was expected of it by its founder, grown into an institution of no mean importance and though only a conventional body with unwritten privileges sanctioned by usage and custom, had commenced to exercise such control over the administration as to render the continuance of autocratic rule a thorough impossibility. It had proved a veritable thorn in the side of the bureaucracy. Since it had come to stay and could not be got rid of, the bureaucracy wanted to make the best of a bad bargain and the popular demand for reforms furnished the long-wished-for opportunity to side track and barricade this inconvenient and meddlesome body so as to ~~make~~ render it indffensive and impotent. With the popular house out of the way, it would be easy to so manipulate a legislative council with no elective majority and consisting of members of their own class and of their own choice and a small elective minority returned on the basis of high voting qualifications. Such an institution is decidedly conservative and Pro-Government and is designed to drown the feeble voice of the popular house and support the bureaucracy in its irresponsible administration. The extremely rare

16

15

contingency of what may be called in strictly official language, a non-official combination against the Government has been amply ---- Provided against by too many checks and safeguards which neutralise any beneficial action in popular interests even by so guardedly --- constituted and conservative a body. The "initiative" and "referendum" (one ought to be ashamed to make use of the terms in reference to the travesty of reforms we have) so highly praised for tending to bring the Ruler en rapport with the people count for nothing since they both depend on the sweet will and pleasure of the Executive Government or its responsible head, the Dewan. Even that last and uncertain constitutional resort of the people, the appeal to the throne, is effectively barred leaving the Executive the sole and undisputed master of the situation. It will thus be seen that the inference that the reforms favour the bureaucracy more than the --- people who stand to lose everything and to gain nothing is neither uncharitable nor far-fetched.

The Committee also makes no secret of its intentions to strengthen the hands of the Executive both in the matter of finance and legislation and to perpetuate its overlordship for all time to come. The popular control over the Executive is to be de jure while that of the latter over the former is to be de facto. They are not in favour of even a partial control of the Executive by the Legislature which has been introduced in British India. They want all ------ control to be in the hands of the Executive Government and extraordinary and unlimited powers in the hands of the Ruler. The Committee's generosity in this respect has over-steped all reasonable bounds. The power of the Crown ~~is~~ to indefinitely prolong the ---- operation of emergency legislation without fixing a short definite period after which it ought to receive Legislative sanction for --- continuance is a notable instance in point. The begrudging spirit of the Committee towards popular demands is manifest in the half-- hearted recommendation regarding the appointment of a non-official to the Executive Council. At the risk of being -----

17

(11

charged with crass ignorance of the elementary principles of dyarchic scheme of Government, the Committee ~~boldly opines~~ to support itself or the Executive Government to which it owes its ----- existence boldly opines that the appointment of a member from the legislative council would introduce dyarchy in the Government and on that ground condemns such a procedure. Would the Committee be so kind as to explain how dyarchy can come in where there is neither division of functions nor divided responsibility ?

The Committee appears to have become conscious however of the inequity it has done in nullifying the reforms and has sought to cover it up by yet another novel theory of the unity of the Sovereign with the people in whose name the former is said to rule and control the Executive by the virtue of his power to create and dismiss them at his will in doing which he is said to carry out the will of the --- people who are represented by the members of the Representative Assembly whose views he is said to ascertain by means of the so-called referendum. Comment on such a preposterous theory is needless. The arrangements proposed by the Committee when accorded legislative or statutory sanction will not only absolve the Executive Government from all moral and legal obligations they were under to the popular bodies but place them in a sense even above effective ---- control by the Ruler himself whose only remedy if at all a strong Ruler intends to employ one lies in dismissing the offending member of Government. Does the Committee really thnik that this is a safeguard that would or could be ---- successfully employed ? The Committee has failed to note to what scandalous and absurd lengths and conclusions a slight, only

(17

very slight extension of their fantastic theory would lead one to.

More curious than the elaboration of this theory is the attempt at comparison of the polity based thereon with the ideally democratic Government of the United States with a balance of arguments in favour of the former. It is astonishing to see otherwise sane, learned and well informed persons taking leave of sobriety and common sense even in matters relating to contemporary history and employ perversions of arguments, analogies and precedents in support of their --- *let* prejudices and theories. Though there may be some remote similarity between the two polities so far as the powers of the president and permanancy of the Executive go, the dissimilarities are too many to justify any comparison whatever. Any casual reader of constitutional history should know that although the President is an autocrat and the Executive --- irremovable, the President is an elected representative of the people who cannot remain longer than a fixed term of years, and that the Executive ~~is~~ *though* responsible to him ~~and~~ has to yield to the wishes of the people or their representatives in the last resort. Above all these there is an independent and elective Judiciary to serve as final appellate authority in cases of disagreement between the Executive and the legislature. Is any one of such safeguards provided by the ----- Committee ?

Finally comes the appeal to Dharma without any reagrd for the sense of proportion or propriety. Dharma was not at

19
18

any time intended to be observed or adhered to only by the subjects. Dharma controlled all from the beggar to the Emperor. No one was permitted to transgress the laws of Dharma and every one from the Emperor downwards had to pay the penalty for lapses and laches. Under Dharma the officers of the Crown were responsible to the Ruler who was in turn directly responsible to his subjects. To --- interpret Dharma or law and advise and help him in the due discharge of his duties he had about him learned, aged and selfless men in whose wisdom and experience both the Ruler and his subjects had full faith. The Ruler's responsibility to the subjects was not of the hazy type but real and tangible. Grievous and continued disregard of Dharma disentitled the Ruler to the respect of the subjects and rendered him liable to payment of the prescribed penalty. For instances, we have only to look into our epics and puranas. There is also evidence though fragmentary yet sufficient to prove the existence in the days when Dharma ruled of popular bodies whose wishes the Ruler had to respect. From this it is clear that the Ruler under Dharma was not an autocrat but a constitutional Monarch who was as much bound by laws and regulations as his subjects were.

One can understand the apotheosis of the Ruler but it is ridiculous to invoke Dharma to perpetuate bureaucratic Government, the more so when Dharma is to be obeyed by only one of the parties while the other is permitted to flout it with impunity. Dharma as personified in the Ruler with the limitations suitable for the time imposed on him ruling under circumstances and conditions now wholly unknown except through the hyperbolic language of poetry

20

19.

might have conduced towards happiness and contentment 2000 years before Christ. Living as we do in the twentieth century after Christ, having wholly lost all traces of our ancient polities and imbibing western culture, ideas and forms of Government it is too late to ask us to go back if only to evolve a purely indigenous system of Government. We ~~must~~ must take the world as it is and not as it ought to be. By no means can we recall the conditions of 2000 years ago however much we may wish therefor. The rule of Dharma should therefore be discarded as of little or no value at the present time

Consequently the theory of unity of the head with the people for which there is no other authority than the ---- ipse dixit of the Committee or the Chairman is even, if --- true, no longer tenable and cannot be sustained by any ----- stretch of exegesis. Any convention raised on such basic theory presupposes a sound, sympathetic ~~theory~~ strong and yet popular Ruler. The moment, however, that personal factor disappears the whole edifice must crumble to pieces. The Committee's proposals may work well until the life time of His Highness under whose beneficent rule our State advanced far more rapidly than it ever did before but no one can ---- guarantee a continuance in His Highnesse's successor the --- same qualities of head and heart so essential for the maintenance in proper order of not only the whole but every part of the structure that has been attempted to be raised on the main support of the personal element. Substitute an inexperienced weak-minded or self-willed Prince in place of our enlightened Ruler the whole edifice tumbles down -- Sturm -- und Drang folowwing as a consequence. We ought therefore

to evolve a distinct polity which by its strength would survive all such vicissitudes as are incidental to a State ---- in the transitional stage of its political development.

There are two models of such an enduring system of ---- Government suitable to the time we live in and to a State like Mysore with a hereditary Ruler at its head. First comes the British model -- the Sovereignty with certain well defined privileges and prerogatives and an executive Government responsible to and subordinate to the Legislature. The second is the American model with some modifications. The hereditary Ruler with an irremovable executive and a popular legislature, the disagreement between the two organs of the body, politic being settled by a general referendum to the people in whom the ultimate sovereign authority rests. Of the two, the latter appears better suited to a small State like ours and also seems more in keeping with the Indian temparament. This ought to be the goal towards which any reforms to be worth trying or having should help us to reach within the shortest possible period. At the same time we cannot also forget that we have already certain institutions, adventitious or excrescent, which we cannot ignore and of which we should make such use and take such advantage as would favour the end we have in view, They are the Representative Assembly, the Legislative Council, the Economic Boards etc., The most important of these is the Assembly. No reforms which would weaken to any the slightest degree the position and status of this body or tend to make it play second fiddle to any other or minimise its usefulness for popular service should be permitted to be introduced however beneficial they may otherwise be. The

(2)

Legislative Council so long as it exists and cannot be ---- conveniently got rid off, should be the Upper or Revising Chamber acting as a check against the impulsiveness of the Assembly. The Advisory Boards and Committees will also have their own sphere of work marked and cut out for them. This ought to be the ground-plan of our future polity.

A bi-camual legislature for a small state is no doubt an economic waste and a costly luxury. Any sane constitutionalist must admit that. If ~~by~~ as is attempted to be done by the Committee the Representative Assembly is to make room for a smaller and necessarily conservative body or at least surrender to it the rights and privileges which belong to it naturally and by virtue of its representation of larger popular interests, it should be stoutly resisted as an ---- unpardonable encroachment on the birth-rights of the people. If it is considered that until the State has politically advanced far enough it would be difficult to secure two or three centuries of pucca legislators and consequently, it would be inexpedient to make it principal Law making body in a bi-camaral legislature, the strength of the Assembly may be temporarily reduced to a hundred and fifty or so but this concession on the part of the people should follow a definite undertaking by Government to convert the Assembly and no other body into the chief law making institution. The formulating and codifying part of the law making process, the preparation of financial and taxation bills and such other duties of a technical character shall be discharged by law, finance and such other appropriate Committees.

But unfortunately or fortunately there is the Legislative Council which was brought into existence by the Government on its own initiative and in the teeth of ---- opposition from well-informed and well-meaning representatives of the people -- a result of irresponsible administration by a select few who presume to know and understand the popular interests better than their own representatives. In a way it is not an unmixed evil. With a non-official majority and a proper constitution to serve as a second and revising Chamber, it will help to steady the popular House and act as an effective check against ~~the~~ rashness haste or impulsiveness to be anticipated of any large popular body in the early days of its development. Besides it will serve as a buffer between the Ruler and the Executive on one side and the popular House on the other. Any ---- disagreement between the two houses can be settled at a joint session or in the event of the popular house swamping the Legislative Council, the powers of veto, restoration and such other allied safeguards vested in the Ruler would effectively restore the balance. The expedient of the joint session is to be utilised for budget discussion to facilitate speedy disposal thereof. The official and --- nominated elements should be eliminated from the popular house. ~~The second Chamber is the legitimate place for them for everywhere a combination generally of boss and special interests~~ The second chamber is legitimate place for them. Whether this second Chamber is to be only a temporary makeshift sliding to the back-ground and finally making its exit as the popular house grows in ---- experience and learns to stand on its own legs or is to --

remain a permanent adjunct to the Legislature of the State is a question which it is too premature to discuss now and may be left to time and circumstances for being determined. It should however be understood that the two Houses are independent of each other and are to have non-official Presidents and Deputy Presidents nominated in the first instance and to be gradually replaced by elective elements.

Finally there is to be the Executive Council appointments to which are to be made by the Ruler. It ought however to have no powers independently of the Ruler in reference to legislation and finance. It is merely to carry out --- the wishes of the Ruler and the legislature. All such --- powers, checks and safeguards such as veto, ratification, emergency legislation etc., are to vest in the Ruler in trust for the people for finally being merged in the optional and --- obligatory referendum to the people.

These are the main lines on which reforms should ---- proceed. Nothing short of this would be either welcome or acceptable.

Let us now summarise the proposals of the Committee to see how for the reforms as intended to be introduced by Government carry us in the realization of the ideal the ---- people have in view. The announcement with the interpretation thereof by the Committee give us :

(1) a wholly irresponsible autocratic Ruler with every --- conceivable sort of power to over-ride the people and their representatives in all and every detail of legislation, ----

(23

remain a permanent adjunct to the Legislature of the State is a question which it is too premature to discuss now and may be left to time and circumstances for being determined. It should however be understood that the two Houses are independent of each other and are to have non-official Presidents and Deputy Presidents nominated in the first instance and to be gradually replaced by elective elements.

Finally there is to be the Executive Council appointments to which are to be made by the Ruler. It ought however to have no powers independently of the Ruler in reference to legislation and finance. It is merely to carry out --- the wishes of the Ruler and the legislature. All such --- powers, checks and safeguards such as veto, ratification, emergency legislation etc., are to vest in the Ruler in trust for the people for finally being merged in the optional and --- obligatory referendum to the people.

These are the main lines on which reforms should ---- proceed. Nothing short of this would be either welcome or acceptable.

Let us now summarise the proposals of the Committee to see how for the reforms as intended to be introduced by Government carry us in the realization of the ideal the ---- people have in view. The announcement with the interpretation thereof by the Committee give us :

(1) a wholly irresponsible autocratic Ruler with every --- conceivable sort of power to over-ride the people and their representatives in all and every detail of legislation, ----

taxation, finance and general administration with no check or hinderence except that of his own good sense, a too ---- uncertain and unreliable an element to be of any practical benefit or to serve as an effective check on maladministration,

(2) An irremovable and irresponsible Executive Government with almost equal powers in a slightly rarified form with no control or check except their own good sense and the --- uncertain one (from the popular view) of their collective (not individual and consequently too abstract to be effective) responsibility to the Ruler,

(3) A conservative and Pro-Government Legislative Council with a non-official majority, an elective minority and an official President with some original powers regarding ---- legislation and taxation, any tendency of even such a body being neutralised by too many powers of restoration and ---- reservation vested in the Executive Government.

(4) A Representative Assembly relegated to the background to play not second but third or even fourth fiddle to a Pro-Government and Conservative Council. It is to contain a free admixture of nominated and official elements. Rights and privileges sanctioned by usage and custom have vanished by its being converted into a statutory body. Its usefulness as a popular convention is reduced to a vanishing point by being made an optionally and not obligatorily consultative and reference body. Optional initiative and referendum privileges rightly belonging to the people at large and never to a Convention however large and representative are attempted to be made the goal of this body giving room for

(25)

the startling inference of its gradual exit instead of its being raised in full time to the high position of Premier Legislative Body.

It is clear from the foregoing summary that the reforms have been neither conceived nor interpreted in a liberal spirit. It looks like an invention of the Executive to silence the popular clamour for a time at least and to strengthen its position by a definite enactment against being assailed in the future. The Committee's report appears to proceed on the gratuitious and unwarranted assumption based on self-conceit and sneering contempt of the professional for the amateur that even after forty years of training in administrative affairs and in spite of the admittedly sane, moderate and dignified manner in which the people have conducted themselves, they are still a pack of boobies unfit to be entrusted with or intimately associated in the discharge of the more responsible functions of Government. A vein of distrust also runs on the very surface of the report and though its entire length. It reiterates and emphasises not only the divinity of the Ruler but the semi divinity of the governing body as well. Such a type of reforms is --- galling to the self-respect of the people and insulting to their instinct and intelligence. It is therefore ---- unacceptable and deserves to be scrapped.

The authors of the announcement as well as of the report do not appear to be unaware of the sort of welcome their performance deserves and is likely to be accorded by those whom it concern. It is to preclude the inevitable rejection

thereof by the people and to stem the tide of carping criticism which they would call forth that they have hit upon the expedient of their promulgation by a Royal Proclamation. His Highness the Maharajah is a well-informed, sympathetic and popular Ruler who takes personal interest in all matters conducing to the welfare of his subjects. The bureaucracy clearly intends to turn His Highness condescension to its own advantage and fortufy its position and perpetuate its semi-divine status through the instrumentality of a Royal Fiat. Though His Highness is a cautious statesman unlikely enough to be misled into a false belief yet the delicacy of the position occupied by the throne is too great to permit of any large initiative independently of the immediate circle of advisers unless backed up by the support of the subjects whose interests ought to be the first and foremost concern of any good Ruler like His Highness. The best and easiest way of ascertaining popular views and the trend of public opinion is to refuse to lend his name to an instrument of which the use or benefit is at best doubtful and to allow the question of reforms to be thrashed out in the popular bodies in the same manner as any other statutory measure.

Moreover, the reforms as intended to be instituted not being really reforms at all but only a solemn affirmation of the rights and privileges of an irresponsible ---- Executive Government with a variety of extra-ordinary, ---- unwarranted, unavailing, unusable and in the hands of any self-willed Ruler wholly undesirable powers reserved to --- the throne more to flatter and titilate the vanity therein

28

(27

Than for any real and good purpose and with a substantial curtailment of the privileges and rights of the people sanctioned by custom and usage, they do not at all deserve to be proclaimed as boons to the subjects by so generous and liberal-minded a Prince as His Highness is trusted to be. It is hoped therefore that His Highness will not lend the use of His august and sacred personality for the aggrandisement of an already power - swollen executive to the detriment of --- popular interests. No doubt His Highness' task is very delicate but Fiat justitia ruat coelum.

H. Ellis Hurford
13th June 1923.

29

G.R.S. VI.—G/39.

SUBJECT (28)

Diary No. of letter replied to

Section Ref.

File No. 32-22

Serial No. 6

GENERAL AND REVENUE SECRETARIAT

( )

, the 191 .

No. 1112.

Mr. A. Krishnarao

Member, Legislative Council

Hosakoppa Post

(Koppa-Kadur)

Date of issue 16.6.23.

Signed by Mr. T.A.G

I am directed to acknowledge the receipt of your communication noted in the margin and to state that the suggestions referred to therein will receive ~~early~~ attention.

I have etc.,

sd/-

for Chief Secretary to Government.

No. date 13.6.23.

Subject Suggestions on the Proposals of the Reforms Committee

Rec'd 16/6

GRSM.566